

Recent Developments in Vacation Queueing Models : A Short Survey

Jau-Chuan Ke¹, Chia-Huang Wu² and Zhe George Zhang^{3*}

¹Department of Applied Statistics, National Taichung Institute of Technology

Taiwan, ROC

²Department of Industrial Engineering and Management, National Chiao Tung University,

Taiwan, ROC

³Department of Decision Science, College of Business and Economics, Western Washington University,

Bellingham, WA 98225-9077, USA

& Faculty of Business Administration, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, BC, Canada

Received October 2010; Revised November 2010; Accepted November 2010

Abstract— Queueing systems with server vacations (server's performing non-queueing jobs) have been studied extensively since the late 70's. A considerable number of works in this area were completed in the early 80's and surveyed by Doshi in 1986. As an extension to the classical queueing system, allowing idle servers to work on non-queueing jobs makes the vacation models more applicable in a variety of systems including flexible manufacturing or service and computer communication systems. Motivated by these applications, more studies on vacation models have been done during the late 80's and 90's and surveyed in the book by Takagi in 1991 and the book by Tian and Zhang in 2006. This paper intends to provide a brief summary of the most recent research works on vacation queueing systems in the past 10 years.

Keywords— server's vacation, batch arrivals, modified vacation policy, working vacations, multi-server vacation models.

1. INTRODUCTION

The queueing model with server vacations (server absences) has been well studied in the past three decades and successfully applied in many areas such as manufacturing/service and computer/communication network systems. These vacation queueing models can be classified according to the arrival processes, service processes, and the vacation policies. Excellent surveys on the earlier works of vacation models have been reported by Doshi (1986), Takagi (1991), Tian and Zhang (2006). In this paper, we briefly survey the studies on vacation models for the past decade. The details of a queueing system with server vacations have been well described in the previous survey papers and books. To make this survey more concise, readers are referred to Doshi (2006) for the definitions, classification, and discussion of different vacation models. We only focus on reporting the types of models and the main methods (if non-traditional) used in the studies conducted over the past 10 years. For technical details of these

* Corresponding author's email: George.zhang@wwu.edu

models, again we refer the readers to the specific papers.

This paper is organized as follows: Section 2 is focused on the recent models with more complex arrival processes. Section 3 reviews the models dealing with different types of vacation policies and service processes. Section 4 presents the recent works on multi-server vacation models. Other new developments of vacation models in the past decade are reported in Section 5. Finally, Section 6 concludes with some possible future research directions.

2. VACATION MODELS WITH VARIANTS OF ARRIVAL PROCESSES

Extensive studies were conducted on the vacation models with batch arrivals. Katayama (2005) considered an $M^{[k]}/G/1$ queue with time-limited service and two types of vacations by using the level-crossing method. Arumuganathan and Ramaswami (2005) analyzed a $M^{[k]}/G(a, b)/1$ queue with two service rates and multiple vacations. Hur and Ahn (2005) studied an $M^{[k]}/G/1$ queue with server vacations and set-up times and obtained the steady-state queue length and waiting time distributions. Ke (2007a) investigated the operating characteristics of an $M^{[k]}/G/1$ queue with single or multiple vacation policy, server breakdown, and startup/closedown times. An $M^{[k]}/G/1$ queue with multiple vacations was investigated by Xu *et al.* (2007), who obtained the probability generating function of queue length, busy period, and the stationary waiting time under FCFS and LCFS service disciplines. At the same time, Wang *et al.* (2007) treated an $M^{[k]}/M/1$ queueing system with multiple vacations and server breakdowns. The maximum entropy principle was employed to develop the approximate probability distributions of various system performance measures. A comparative analysis between the exact and approximate results was performed. Later, Ke and Lin (2008) also used the maximum entropy approach to investigate an $M^{[k]}/G/1$ queue with N policy, server breakdowns, and single vacation policy. Moreover, Omei and Gulck (2008) showed that the maximum entropy estimate of Wang *et al.* (2007) could be significantly improved by including the exact probability of the empty system in the constraints. For the vacation model with both batch arrivals and services, Sikdar and Gupta (2008) analyzed an $M^{[k]}/G^{[m]}/1/N$ queue with single/multiple vacation(s). They derived the stationary distributions of the number of customers and other performance measures. Some numerical results were presented to show the impact of changing some parameter on the system performance.

Another recent development in vacation model research is on the system with Markov Arrival Process (MAP). Gupta and Sikdar (2006) studied an MAP/G/1/N queue with single or multiple vacation policies and found the stationary distributions of number of customers at service completions, vacation terminations, pre-arrival, and arbitrary epochs. Furthermore, Banik *et al.* (2006) investigated a finite buffer MAP/G/1/N queue under single / multiple vacation policies and obtained the queue length distributions. Wu *et al.* (2009) studied a BMAP/G/1 type queue with both positive and negative customers, the second optional service, and multiple vacations. They developed the queue length distributions and the mean of the busy period by using the supplementary variable, the censoring technique, and the renewal theory.

3. VACATION MODELS WITH VARIANTS OF VACATION POLICIES

Modified vacation policy:

Zhang and Tian (2001) investigated a Geo/G/1 queue with multiple adaptive vacations (MAV) where the server can take at most a certain number (J) of vacations continuously. Ke and Chu (2006) studied a batch arrival system with MAV. The MAV can be considered as a modified vacation policy. An MAV is reduced to the single or multiple vacation policy by setting the value of J to be one or infinity. Later, Ke (2007b) extended the model in Ke and Chu (2006) to the case with customer balking behavior. Ke *et al.* (2010a) generalized the model to the case with N-policy. Furthermore, Ke *et al.* (2010b) investigated the threshold model of Ke *et al.* (2010a) with a randomized control policy. Later, more works on the models with the modified vacation policies were done. For example, Ke and Chang (2009a) considered an M/G/1 retrial queue with modified vacation policy, customer balking, and feedbacks. Chang and Ke (2009) investigated an $M^{[k]}/G/1$ retrial queue with modified vacation policy by applying the supplementary variable technique. Ke and Chang (2009a) extended Chang and Ke's model to more general cases with impatience customers and feedback behaviors.

Bernoulli vacation policy:

Madan *et al.* (2003) analyzed an M/M/2 queue with a single Bernoulli schedule vacation policy and discussed two models under different conditions. Choudhury and Madan (2004) considered a batch arrival queueing system

with two phase service and Bernoulli vacation. Choudhury and Madan (2005) further investigated the system with a modified Bernoulli vacation and N-policy. Tadj et al. (2006) studied a bulk service queueing system with random setup time under the Bernoulli vacation and N-policy. They developed an algorithm to determine the optimal policy. Later, Choudhury (2007) extended this model to a two-phase batch arrival retrial queueing system with Bernoulli vacations. Also Choudhury *et al.* (2007) examined an $M^{[k]}/G/1$ queue with two-phase service and Bernoulli vacation and multiple vacation policy. Choudhury (2008) analyzed an $M/G/1$ retrial queue with two-phase service and Bernoulli vacation schedule.

Recently, Kumar *et al.* (2009) studied an $M/M/c$ retrial queueing system with Bernoulli vacations and obtained various system performance measures. Ke and Chang (2009b) investigated an $M^{[k]}/(G_1, G_2)/1$ retrial queue under Bernoulli vacation schedules with general repeated attempts and starting failures.

Working vacation policy (WV):

Servi and Finn (2002) first introduced the concept of working vacation in a single server system. In such a system denoted by $M/M/1/WV$, the server would work at a different rate rather than completely stop during the vacation period. The explicit formulae for the mean, variance, and distribution of the number and time in the system were presented. After that, the research interests on working vacation models grew fast. Liu *et al.* (2007) examined stochastic decomposition structures of the queue length and waiting time in an $M/M/1/WV$ queue. Xu *et al.* (2009) extended the $M/M/1/WV$ queue to a bulk input $M^{[k]}/M/1/WV$ queue and obtained the upper and lower bounds of the mean waiting time by using the properties of the conditional Erlang distribution.

For the general input queue, Baba (2005) analyzed a $GI/M/1$ queue with multiple working vacations and derived the distribution of sojourn time for an arbitrary customer. Later, the finite capacity $GI/M/1$ queue with multiple working vacations was studied by Banik *et al.* (2007). The $GI/M/1$ queue with working vacation and vacation interruption was discussed by Li *et al.* (2008). Afterward, the comparison analysis between the $GI/M/1$ and the $GI/Geo/1$ queues with single working vacation was provided by Chae *et al.* (2009).

For the general service time, Wu and Takagi (2006) investigated the $M/G/1$ queue with multiple working vacations and derived the stationary distributions for the queue size and the system time by utilizing the transient solution for the queue length of an $M/G/1$ queue. Li *et al.* (2009) used the matrix analytic method to analyze an $M/G/1$ queue with exponentially working vacations under a specific assumption. They obtained the conditional stochastic decomposition result and the joint distribution for queue length and service status.

Recently, Lin and Ke (2009) considered the multi-server system with single working vacation. The matrix-geometric approach was utilized to develop the computable explicit formula for the probability distributions of queue length and other performance measures. Yang, *et al.* (2010) treated the F -policy $M/M/1/K$ queue with single working vacation and exponential startup times and derived the stationary distributions and related system characteristics, including an optimization numerical analysis. Jain and Jain (2010) investigated a single-server working-vacation model with server breakdowns of multiple types.

4. MULTI-SERVER VACATION MODELS

Multi-server vacation models were studied by a number of researchers over the past decade. The servers in these models can either take the same vacation together (called synchronous vacation) or take individual vacations (asynchronous vacations) independently. Zhang and Tian (2004) first studied the multi-server model with asynchronous vacations which represents a service system with multi-task employees. More multi-server vacation models are based on synchronous vacations. Under such a policy, a group of servers take vacations together when the vacation condition is met. Zhang and Tian (2003a, 2003b) first analyzed the Markovian multi-server queueing system with single/multiple synchronous vacations. Moreover, Tian and Zhang (2003) investigated a more general $GI/M/c$ queueing system with phase-type vacations where all servers take multiple vacations together until waiting customers exist at a vacation completion instant. Tian and Zhang (2006) considered a multi-server queueing system with a threshold type (d, N) vacation policy under which d idle servers keep taking multiple synchronous vacations until the number of customers reaches or exceeds a threshold N . A computational study is presented for determining the optimal values of d and N . Another multi-server vacation model with single vacation and threshold policy was treated by Xu and Zhang (2006). Zhang (2005) presented an analysis on the multi-server vacation model with three threshold policy. Yue *et al.* (2006) studied a finite buffer multi-server queue with balking, reneging, and single synchronous vacation policy. They obtained the stationary distributions of the queue length and some other performance measures in matrix forms. A multi-server model with MAP and synchronous phase-type vacations was investigated by Chakravarthy (2007). Several special cases with MAPs and numerical examples were presented, including the table of optimal values of system parameters and the corresponding system performances measures. Recently, Ke *et al.* (2009) studied the optimal (d, c) vacation policy for finite capacity $M/M/c/N$ queue with

unreliable servers and repairs. Chakravarthy (2009) analyzed the MAP/M/c system with phase type vacation and presented some interesting numerical illustrations. Recently, Gharbi and Ioualalen (2010) studied the finite-source multi-server queueing systems with single/multiple vacation policies and developed some the algorithms for computing the system performance measures.

5. OTHER VACATION MODELS

Rahmoune and Aissani (2008) used the strong stability method to study the characteristics of the M/G/1/N queue with multiple vacations where the rate of the vacations is sufficiently small. This method is also useful in analyzing complex queueing systems such as retrial queueing systems with unreliable servers, with batch arrivals, or with priorities. Thangaraj and Vanitha (2009) studied a two-phase M/G/1 queue with Bernoulli feedback and multiple-vacation policy where the two stage service and rejoining behavior (feedback) of customers are considered. Both single server and multi-server vacation models with impatient customers were discussed by Altman and Yechiali (2006). Customers waiting in the queue may leave the system before getting the service if their waiting times are too long. Multi-server vacation models with this feature may be more appropriate for analyzing call centers. As an extension to the M/G/1 type vacation model, Zhang, *et al.* (2001) studied the optimal service policies that minimize the long-term average cost of a vacation system with multiple vacation types. Furthermore, Zhang (2006) also presented the proof of some convexity of the average cost function in the threshold in a single server vacation model. Choudhury (2002) analyzed the M/G/1 queue with multiple vacations of two types and obtained the stationary queue length waiting time distributions.

6. CONCLUDING REMARKS

Although extensive works have been done in the vacation model area over the past three decades as surveyed in Doshi (1986), Takagi (1991), Tian and Zhang (2006), and some survey papers including this paper, there are still many open problems for further studies. Here we just mention a few directions for future research.

Most past works were focused on one-stage queueing systems with server vacations and queueing networks with some stations having server vacations have not been investigated. Investigating queueing network with vacations can be a research topic. Also, there are many possible extensions on the multi-server vacation models which have not been explored. For example, the multi-server vacation model with heterogeneous servers has not been considered in the literature. One reason for these open problems may be due to the “curse of dimensionality” caused by the complexity of the systems. Developing good approximations to these complex vacation models will be a fruitful future research direction. Another direction is to analyze the vacation models with more complex vacation policies motivated by real systems. For example, it is worth extending the two threshold policy to the multiple threshold policy in a multi-server vacation models where the number of servers on vacations depends on the queue length. Finally, generalizing the single server model with multi-types of vacations to the multi-server settings is an interesting future research topic.

REFERENCE

1. Altman, E. and Yechiali, U. (2006). Analysis of customers' impatience in queues with server vacations. *Queueing system*, 52: 261-279.
2. Arumuganathan, R. and Ramaswami, K. S. (2005). Analysis of a balk queue with fast and slow service rates and multiple vacations. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Operational Research*, 22(2): 239-260.
3. Baba, Y. (2005). Analysis of a GI/M/1 queue with multiple working vacations. *Operations Research Letters*, 33: 201-209.
4. Banik, A. D., Gupta, U. C. and Pathak, S. S. (2006). Finite buffer vacation models under E-limited with limit variation service and Markovian arrival process. *Operations Research Letters*, 34: 539-547.
5. Banik, A. D., Gupta, U. C. and Pathak, S. S. (2007). On the GI/M/1/N queue with multiple working vacations - analytic analysis and computation. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 31: 1701-1710.
6. Chae, K. C., Lim, D. E. and Yang, W. S. (2009). The GI/M/1 queue and the GI/Geo/1 queue both with single working vacation. *Performance Evaluation*, 66: 356-367.
7. Chakravarthy, S. R. (2007). A multi-server synchronous vacation model with thresholds and a probabilistic decision rule. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 182: 305-320.
8. Chakravarthy, S. R. (2009). Analysis of a multi-server queue with Markovian arrivals and synchronous phase type

- vacations. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Operational Research*, 26(1): 85-113.
9. Chang, F. M. and Ke, J. C. (2009). On a batch retrial model with J vacations. *Journal of Computational and Applied Mathematics*, 232: 402-414.
 10. Choudhury, G. (2002). Some aspects of M/G/1 queue with two different vacation times under multiple vacation policy. *Stochastic Analysis and Applications*, 20(5): 901-909.
 11. Choudhury, G. (2007). A two phase batch arrival retrial queueing system with Bernoulli vacation schedule. *Applied Mathematics and Computation*, 188: 1455-1466.
 12. Choudhury, G. (2008). Steady state analysis of an M/G/1 queue with linear retrial policy and two phase service under Bernoulli vacation schedule. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 32: 2480-2489.
 13. Choudhury, G. and Madan, K. C. (2004). A two phase batch arrival queueing system with a vacation time under Bernoulli schedule. *Applied Mathematics and Computation*, 149: 337-349.
 14. Choudhury, G. and Madan, K. C. (2005). A two-state batch arrival queueing system with a modified Bernoulli schedule vacation under N-policy. *Mathematical and Computer Modelling*, 42: 71-85.
 15. Choudhury, G., Tadj, L. and Paul, M. (2007). Steady state analysis of an $M^{[k]}/G/1$ queue with two phase service and Bernoulli vacation schedule under multiple vacation policy. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 31, 1079-1091.
 16. Doshi, B. T. (1986). Queueing systems with vacation - a survey, *Queueing Systems*, 1: 29-66.
 17. Gharbi, N. and Ioualalen, M. (2010). Numerical investigation of finite-source multiserver systems with different vacation policies. *Journal of Computational and Applied Mathematics*. 234: 625-635.
 18. Gupta, U. C. and Sikdar, K. (2006). Computing queue length distributions in MAP/G/1 N queue under single and multiple vacation. *Applied Mathematics and Computation*, 174: 1498-1525.
 19. Hur, S. and Ahn, S. (2005). Batch arrival queues with vacations and server setup. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 29: 1164-1181.
 20. Jain, M. and Jain, A. (2010). Working vacations queueing model with multiple types of server breakdowns. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 34: 1-13.
 21. Katayama, T. (2005). Level-crossing approach to a time-limited service system with two types of vacations. *Operations Research Letters*, 33: 295-300.
 22. Ke, J. C. (2007a). Batch arrival queues under vacation policies with server breakdown and startup/closedown times. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 31: 1282-1292.
 23. Ke, J. C. (2007b). Operating characteristic analysis on the $M^{[k]}/G/1$ system with a variant vacation policy and balking. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 31: 1321-1337.
 24. Ke, J. C. and Chang, F. M. (2009a). Modified vacation policy for M/G/1 retrial queue with balking and feedback. *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, 57: 433-443.
 25. Ke, J. C. and Chang, F. M. (2009b). $M^{[k]}/(G_1, G_2)/1$ retrial queue under Bernoulli vacation schedules with general repeated attempts and starting failures. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 33: 3186-3196.
 26. Ke, J. C. and Chu, Y. K. (2006). A modified vacation model $M^{[k]}/G/1$ system. *Applied Stochastic Models in Business and Industry*, 22: 1-16.
 27. Ke, J. C. and Lin, C. H. (2008). Maximum entropy approach for batch-arrival under N policy with an un-reliable server and single vacation. *Journal of Computational and Applied Mathematics*, 221: 1-15.
 28. Ke, J. C., Huang, H. I. and Chu, Y. K. (2010a). Batch arrival queue with N -policy and at most J vacations. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 34: 451-466.
 29. Ke, J. C., Huang, K. B. and Pearn, W. L. (2010b). Randomized policy of a Poisson input queue with J vacations. *Journal of Systems Science and Systems Engineering*, 19(1) : 050-071.
 30. Ke, J. C., Lin, C. H., Yang, J. Y. and Zhang, Z. G. (2009). Optimal (d, c) vacation policy for a finite buffer M/M/c queue with unreliable servers and repairs. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 33: 3949-3962.
 31. Kumar, B. K., Rukmani, R. and Thangaraj, V. (2009). An M/M/C retrial queueing system with Bernoulli vacations, *Journal of Systems Science and Systems Engineering*, 18(2) : 222-242.
 32. Li, J. H., Tian, N. and Ma, Z. Y. (2008). Performance analysis of GI/M/1 queue with working vacations and vacation interruption. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 32: 2715-2730.
 33. Li, J. H., Tian, N., Zhang, Z. G. and Luh, H. P. (2009). Analysis of the M/G/1 queue with exponentially working vacations - a matrix analytic approach. *Queueing Systems*, 61: 139-166.
 34. Lin, C. H. and Ke, J. C. (2009). Multi-server system with single working vacation. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 33: 2967-2977.
 35. Liu, W. Y., Xu, X. L. and Tian, N. (2007). Stochastic decompositions in the M/M/1 queue with working vacations. *Operations Research Letters*, 35: 595-600.
 36. Madan, K. C., Abu-Dayyeh, W. and Taiyyan, F. (2003). A two server queue with Bernoulli schedules and a single vacation policy. *Applied Mathematics and Computation*, 145: 59-71.

37. Omeiy, E. and Gulck, S. V. (2008). Note on the article: Maximum entropy analysis of the $M^{[k]}/M/1$ queueing system with multiple vacations and server breakdowns. *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, 54: 1078-1086.
38. Rahmoune, F. and Aissani, D. (2008). Strong stability of queues with multiple vacation of the server. *Stochastic Analysis and Applications*, 26: 665-678.
39. Servi, L. D. and Finn, S. G. (2002). $M/M/1$ queues with working vacations ($M/M/1/WV$). *Performance Evaluation*, 50: 41-52.
40. Sikdar, K. and Gupta, U. C. (2008). On the batch arrival batch service queue with finite buffer under server's vacation : $M^{[k]}/G^{[m]}/1/N$ queue. *Computers and Mathematics with Applications*, 56: 2861-2873.
41. Tadj, L., Choudhury, G. and Tadj, C. (2006). A quorum queueing system with a random setup time under N -policy and with Bernoulli vacation schedule. *Quality Technology & Quantitative Management*, 3(2): 145-160.
42. Takagi, H. (1991). Queueing analysis : a foundation of performance evaluation, Vol. I, vacation and priority systems, Part I. North-Holland, Amsterdam.
43. Thangaraj, V. and Vanitha, S. (2009). A two phase $M/G/1$ feedback queue with multiple server vacation. *Stochastic Analysis and Applications*, 27: 1231-1245.
44. Tian, N. and Zhang, Z. G. (2003). Stationary distribution of $GI/M/c$ queue with PH type vacations. *Queueing systems*, 44: 183-202.
45. Tian, N. and Zhang, Z. G. (2006) *Vacation Queueing Models – Theory and Applications*, Springer, NewYork.
46. Tian, N. and Zhang, Z. G. (2006b). A two threshold vacation policy in multiserver queueing systems. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 168: 153-163.
47. Wang, K. H., Chan, M. C. and Ke, J. C. (2007). Maximum entropy analysis of the $M^{[k]}/M/1$ queueing system with multiple vacations and server breakdowns. *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, 52: 192-202.
48. Wu, D. A. and Takagi, H. (2006). $M/G/1$ queue with multiple working vacations. *Performance Evaluation*, 63: 654-681.
49. Wu, J., Liu, Z. and Peng, Y. (2009). On the BMAP/G/1 G-queues with second optional service and multiple vacations. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 33: 4314-4325.
50. Xu, Q., Bao, S., Ma, Z. and Tian, N. (2007). $M^{[k]}/G/1$ queue with multiple vacations. *Stochastic Analysis and Applications*, 25: 217-140.
51. Xu, X. L., Liu, M. X. and Zhao, X. H. (2009). The balk input $M^{[k]}/M/1$ queue with working vacations. *Journal of Systems Science and Systems Engineering*, 18(3) : 358-368.
52. Xu, X. L. Zhang, Z.G. (2006). The analysis of multi-server queue with single vacation and a (e, d) policy, *Performance Evaluation*, 63(8): 825-838.
53. Yang, D. Y., Wang, K. H. and Wu, C. H. (2010). Optimization and sensitivity analysis of controlling arrivals in the queueing system with single working vacation. *Journal of Computational and Applied Mathematics*, 234: 545-556.
54. Yue, D., Yue, W. and Sun, Y. (2006). Performance analysis of an $M/M/c/N$ queueing system with balking, renegeing and synchronous vacations of partial servers. *ISORA'06*, pp.128-143.
55. Zhang, Z.G. and Tian, N. (2001). Discrete-time $Geo/G/1$ queue with multiple adaptive vacations. *Queueing Systems*, 38: 419-429.
56. Zhang, Z. G. and Tian, N. (2003a). Analysis of queueing system with synchronous single vacation for some servers. *Queueing systems*, 45: 161-175.
57. Zhang, Z. G. and Tian, N. (2003b). Analysis on queueing systems with synchronous vacations of partial servers. *Performance Evaluation*, 52: 269-282.
58. Zhang, Z. G. and Tian, N. (2001). $Geo/G/1$ queue with multiple adaptive vacations. *Queueing Systems*, 38(4): 419-429.
59. Zhang, Z. G., Vickson, R. and Love, E. (2001). The optimal service policies in an $M/G/1$ queueing system with multiple vacation types. *INFOR*, 39(4): 357-366.
60. Zhang, Z. G. (2005). On the Three Threshold Policy in the Multi-server Queueing System with Vacations, *Queueing Systems*, 51(1-2): 173-186.
61. Zhang, Z. G. (2006). On the Convexity Property of the Two Threshold Policy for $M/G/1$ Queue with Two Types of Vacations, *Operations Research Letters*. 34(4): 473-476.